

Minutes of the Project Monitoring and Evaluation Group Meeting held on 14th September, 2011 to consider the Computer Education Plans of State Governments of Madhya Pradesh, Meghalaya, Mizoram, U.P. Rajasthan and UT Administration of Puddicherry and proposals from SIET- Kerala and SIET- Hyderabad.

.....

The second meeting of the Project Monitoring and Evaluation Group (PMEG) for the Centrally sponsored scheme of 'ICT in Schools' was held on 14th September, 2011 at 1100 hrs in Conference Room under the Chairpersonship of Secretary (SE&L) to consider the Computer Education Plans (CEPs) received from the State Governments of Madhya Pradesh, Meghalaya, Mizoram, U.P. Uttarkhand, Rajasthan and UT Administration of Lakshadweep and Puddicherry and proposals from SIET, Kerala and SIET, Hyderabad. Representatives of the State of Uttarakhand and UT Administration of Lakshadweep had not attended the meeting and CEP of these States were not considered by PMEG. The list of participants is annexed.

2. At the outset, Director (SE) welcomed all the Members of the PMEG, representatives of the State Governments/UT Administrations/Organizations.
3. Thereafter the Computer Education Plan of the States/UTs were taken for consideration of PMEG.

4. Madhya Pradesh

4.1. Commissioner, School Education, Madhya Pradesh made a presentation which is summarized below:

- Implementation of ICT Scheme in the State of Madhya Pradesh is bad due to certain problems. The State has now changed the model of implementation and assured that the scheme would be implemented definitely in the currently financial year.
- State Govt. has submitted proposals for coverage of 4000 schools which included previous sanction of 2000 schools.

- State Govt. now proposes to cover only 2000 schools under BOOT Model for a period of five years.
- Rs.8.00 crores released in 2007-08 for 320 schools sanctioned under ICT Scheme is still unutilized and revalidation permission for utilizing the same during the current financial year was sought.
- Commissioner, School Education stated that the State is facing four problems in the implementation of the scheme:
 - (i) 10 computers not enough for hand-on exercise.
 - (ii) Qualitative monitoring is difficult due to computer illiteracy Principals.
 - (iii) Trainers may not of high quality leading to poor learning.
 - (iv) Recurring expenditure is provided for only one year.
- Commissioner School Education elaborated that there is no scope of verification of the qualified trainer being appointed as the remuneration given by the vendors is very low. In fact, he elaborated that in some other States, it is as low as Rs.2000/-.
- State Govt. proposes to implement the scheme as it provides an opportunity for the central development of rural youth and popularizing e-commerce in rural hinterland.
- Commissioner School Education shared details of how the ICT Scheme is proposed to be implemented in the States.
- The States proposes to provide 25 computers per school as against 10 computers earmarked in the scheme.
- State Govt proposes to implement the scheme on PPP Model and PPP partner would be given maximum of 40% of the project on annually basis, with the balance 60% to be put in by PPP partner.
- Private vendors would be authorized to use the assets for commercialized purpose beyond school hours.
- The schools are proposed to be grouped in such a way as to cross-subsidize unviable areas.

- The possible benefit of implementing the ICT Schema as per the model of the State Govt. is that the quality of instructors will be good in order to recover the investment leading to possible learning by students.
- More than 1.00 lakhs rural youth are likely to develop computer proficiency.
- Increased reach of e-commerce and e-services of the rural areas of the State.
- Cabinet approval and approval from all others have been obtained for implementation of the ICT Scheme as per the above model proposed.
- Even though the cost of the implementation of the scheme as per the model of Madhya Pradesh would be high, the State would be implementing the scheme within the budgetary provision made under the ICT scheme and that the balance funds required for running the scheme will be sponsored by the State Govt.
- The State has made a budgetary provision of Rs.40.00 crores (Rs.30.00 crores as Central share and Rs.10.00 crores as State share).

4.2. After the presentation following observations were made by the members:

- The Chairperson cautioned the representative of the State Govt. stating that ICT Policy is in the final stages and there every likelihood of the scheme being revised to confirm with the ICT Policy. There is also another likelihood of the central Govt. not even able to provide financial assistance in the 12th Five Year Plan. This is mainly because there is thinking in the Govt. of the likelihood of subsuming ICT Scheme under RMSA in the 12th Five Year Plan. If this materializes then the norms of financial assistance being provided may undergo a sea change. The Chairperson stated that one of the main reasons for emphasizing the likelihood of changes in the funding pattern, in view of the proposed ICT Policy as well as likelihood of subsuming in RMSA, is that the implications for the State Govt. would be huge as compared to other

States as the State of Madhya Pradesh has proposed to implement the ICT Scheme under PPP mode.

- The Chairperson stated that the State of Madhya Pradesh has not implemented the scheme in the first four years of the XI Five Year Plan and has now come out with a new model plan for implementation of the scheme at the fag end of the XI Five Year Plan.
- Chairperson intimated that NVEQF is proposed to be implemented on a Pilot Mode in Haryana and West Bengal.
- There is a danger in the implementation of the scheme as proposed by the State Govt., particularly with reference to usage of the infrastructure after schools hours for commercial purposes by the vendor. Members expressed apprehension that the students may be forced to participate in the coaching centre after school hours.
- Prof. Rajaram Sharma, Joint Director, CIET brought to the notice of the Committee that criteria being evolved, to find out as to whether computers are in working condition, would involve additional overhead cost per computer.
- Chairperson stated that there is some apprehension about the implementation of the scheme under BOOT Model as it is mostly vendor driven. In the short term it would be viable but from the pedagogical point of view it will not be advisable in the long term.
- Commissioner, School Education stated that adequate steps have been taken in the SLS being prepared and all the apprehensions/concerns raised by the members as well as the Chairperson would be take care of in the SLS.
- Whether the proposed model of the State Govt. has been tested. This was clarified by Commissioner School Education that 11 bidders have applied for implementation of the scheme which implied that there is market acceptance for the same. It was argued that the market acceptability is not the only and main criteria but the outcome of the increasing capacity of the students and making them computer literacy should be the sole criteria. State Govt. can implement the scheme on

a pilot mode, which can be evaluated and parameters of evaluating them needs to be evolved.

- Prof.Gautam Bose, DDG, NIC sought clarification about the content part as well as teachers training as the proposed proposal appears to cater only to hardware component. It was clarified by the State representative that GOI guidelines are being adhered to in the matter of localization and development of e-content and teachers training.
- Recurring expenditure, as per the scheme, is for a period of 5 years and not 1 year as stated by the State Govt. representative.
- The time frame by which the implementation of the scheme would be taken was sought.
- On the apprehension raised by the Chairperson and other members of PMEG the representative of the State Govt. categorically stated that even in the likelihood of the scheme being closed/or change in the norms of sharing pattern, the State Govt. would have no problem in the implementation of the ICT Scheme as a State Project.

4.3. After discussion, following decisions were taken:

- (i) 2000 schools already approved by PMEG under the pre-revised scheme would be cancelled.
- (ii) PMEG has recommended for coverage of 2000 schools under BOOT Model for a period of five year w.e.f. 2011-12 to 2015-16.
- (iii) The central share of Rs.4.8 lakhs per school (Non-recurring would be released as follow:
 - (a) 2011-12 for 2000 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school.
 - (b) 2012-13 for 2000 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - (c) 2013-14 for 2000 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - (d) 2014-15 for 2000 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - (e) 2015-16 for 2000 schools @ Rs0.80 lakh per school

- iv) Unspent balance of Rs.8.00 crores lying unutilized with the State Govt. would be revalidated and necessary permission granted for utilizing the same for coverage of 2000 schools under BOOT Model.
- v) State Govt. would first utilize the unspent balance and based on the UC of earlier release the balance of 1st year's installment would be released subject to the following conditions:
 - (a) State Govt. would submit the list of 2000 schools recommended by PMEG.
 - (b) State Govt. would submit details of SC/ST students in 2000 schools as funds have to be released under 'General', 'SC Sub Head' and 'ST Sub Head'.
- vi) State would share the SLS Agreement with the Central Govt.
- vii) Recurring expenditure would be processed on file on reimbursement basis on submission of actual expenditure incurred and on installment of infrastructure.

5. Meghalaya

5.1. Secretary, Education, Govt. of Meghalaya made a presentation, highlights of which is as under:

- 545 (452 secondary and 93 higher secondary schools) are there in Meghalaya.
- Computer Education was introduced in the State in 2004 under the 11th Finance Commission Award and 36 schools (15 Govt. and 21 Govt. aided schools) were covered.
- 416 schools (355 secondary and 61 higher secondary schools) were already covered under ICT scheme.

- Present proposal is to cover remaining 164 schools (134 secondary and 30 higher secondary schools) in the State. This will include all the schools under 9 Educationally Backward Blocks (EBBs).
- State Govt. also proposes to establish 4 Smart Schools
- Third Party Evaluation of the implementation of ICT scheme was undertaken by IIM Shillong.
- Third Party Evaluation had revealed that 33.3% of schools were above average; 33.3% were average and only 29.3% were below average.
- Evaluation was undertaken on the following 7 criteria:
 - i) School receptiveness
 - ii) Computer Trainer Willingness
 - iii) Computer Trainer Competence
 - iv) Other Trainer Competence
 - v) School Work Climate
 - vi) School Learning Climate
 - vii) Student Performance
- 2421 computer and 345 printers have been installed.
- All schools covered under ICT scheme have internet facility.
- Computer labs will be set up in all the schools to be covered under the scheme.
- The schools will be connected with broadband internet connectivity, wherever available. In other places, data card, USB Modem will be explored.
- Provisions have been made for ensuring power supply. Generator sets will be provided, wherever it is needed.
- Under RMSA 5 computer labs are proposed to be set up.
- Teachers appointed by the vendors gets salary as per the provisions of the scheme, as there is an active involvement of Village system and any mismatch in the salary being given and provided are immediately reported to the Principal of the Schools.

5.2. After the presentation following observations were made by the members:

- State Govt. has indicated that some of the schools do not have electricity. Members desired to know as to how the State is proposing to implement the scheme in schools which do not have electricity. It was clarified by the representative of the State Govt. that electricity is available even in the remotest village in the form of Transformers. The schools have to get connection from the transformers, for which action is already under way.
- As regards approval sought for establishment of 4 smart schools, it was clarified to the State that PMEG has already recommended for establishment of 4 smart schools vide its meeting held 1.10.2010. However, the funds have not been released due to the State not providing details of SC and ST students as funds have to be released under different sub heads.

5.3. After discussions, following decision was taken:

- i) PMEG recommended for coverage of 164 schools (134 secondary and 30 higher secondary schools) under BOOT model for a period of 5 years w.e.f. 2011-12.
- ii) The Central assistance would be phased at the rate of Rs.1.76 lakh per school per year for the first year and Rs.1.00 lakh for the next four years.

6. **Mizoram**

6.1. The representative of the State of Mizoram had stated that she is not aware of the details of schools proposed to be established as Smart schools. Hence the proposal of the State Govt. for establishment of 4 smart schools was deferred.

7. Uttar Pradesh

7.1. Secretary, Secondary Education, Government of Uttar Pradesh, made a presentation, highlights of which are as under:

- There were 5608 schools (1630 secondary and 4005 higher secondary schools) in the State.
- 4000 schools (631 secondary and 3369 higher secondary schools) have already been covered under ICT scheme.
- Present proposal is for coverage of remaining 1608 schools (972 secondary and 636 higher secondary schools).
- Necessary budgetary provision has been made for implementation of the scheme.
- 5.58 lakhs students would be covered.
- 2500 schools in the first phase has been through BOOT model. Agencies identified through open tender process with agreements being signed in July 2009.
- 1500 schools in the second phase is being implemented through BOOT model with UPDESCO as implementing partner.
- UPDESCO, in turn, has signed a MOU with TCIL for implementation of the scheme.
- Installation of computer and accessories in all 4000 schools along with instructors are in place. Curriculum has been approved by the Madhyamik Shiksha Parishad, U.P.
- State level Cell has been constituted for monitoring the implementation of the scheme. Monthly reviews are held
- State has encountered problems in getting the scheme evaluated by a Third Party. IIT Kanpur had sought huge sum to get the scheme evaluated. State has therefore proposed to evaluate the scheme through its Technical Department.
- Appropriate trainers are not available in big cities like Allahabad, Lucknow, Kanpur, etc. as the remuneration being provided is

inadequate particularly for secondary schools. In rural areas there is no problem.

- State Govt. has implemented the project in the 1st phase @ Rs.8.36 lakhs against Rs.6.70 lakh sanctioned by the Gol and had sought clarification as to whether financial assistance can be enhanced as under the pre-revised scheme there is no provision of recurring expenditure for teacher; diesel; telephone charges etc.

7.2. After the presentation, following were the observations made:

- Evaluation of the scheme has to be done by any third party and not by another department of the State. The third party evaluation proposed to be undertaken by Technical Department was not agreed to.
- Under the pre-revised ICT scheme, there is also a provision of Rs.1.34 lakh per school as recurring expenditure and barring a few States none of the other States has submitted the proposal.

7.3. After discussions, following decisions were taken:

- i) PMEG had recommended coverage of remaining 1608 schools (972 secondary and 636 higher secondary schools) under BOOT model for a period of 5 years w.e.f. 2011-12.
- ii) The central share of Rs.4.8 lakhs per school (Non-recurring) would be released as follow:
 - a. 2011-12 for 1608 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school.
 - b. 2012-13 for 1608 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - c. 2013-14 for 1608 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - d. 2014-15 for 1608 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - e. 2015-16 for 1608 schools @ Rs0.80 lakh per school

- iii) Recurring expenditure would be processed on file on reimbursement basis on submission of actual expenditure incurred and on installment of infrastructure.

8. Rajasthan

8.1. Director, Secondary Education, Govt. of Rajasthan, made a presentation, highlights of which were as under:

- There were 11649 schools (8208 secondary and 3441 higher secondary schools) in the State.
- 6500 schools (3546 secondary and 2954 higher secondary schools) have already been covered under ICT in schools scheme.
- State Govt. sought approval of PMEG for coverage of 2000 schools (1869 secondary and 131 higher secondary schools).
- State Govt. is facing problems in getting the scheme evaluated by third party as twice open tenders were invited but no suitable party has been found for getting the scheme evaluated.
- State proposes to get the scheme evaluated through Vanspura Videepeth and sought permission for getting this done.
- Funds for establishment of 4 smart schools in the State is still awaited.

8.2. After the presentation, following observations were made by the Members:

- 2000 schools, for which the State Govt. had sought for approval, had already been recommended for coverage by PMEG vide its meeting held on 27.1.2011. However, due to paucity of funds, financial assistance was not provided in 2010-11.
- Funds for the same would be released during the current financial year on submission of utilization certificate of earlier releases; budgetary provision made for 2011-12 and details of SC and ST students proposed to be covered in these 2000 schools.

- No proposal for establishment of 4 smart schools has been received nor approved by PMEG.

8.3. After discussions, following were the decisions taken by PMEG:

- i) Financial assistance for coverage of 2000 schools would be released subject to the State submitting utilization certificate of earlier releases; budgetary provision made for 2011-12 and details of SC and ST students proposed to be covered in these 2000 schools.
- ii) Proposal for establishment of 4 smart schools would be considered by PMEG after submission of the same along with details of location of the schools; infrastructure available in these schools; student : teacher ratio, etc.

9. **Pudducherry**

9.1. Secretary, Education, UT Administration of Pudducherry, made a presentation, highlights of which are under:

- There are 207 schools (154 secondary and 53 higher secondary schools) in UT of Pudducherry.
- 25 secondary schools have already been covered under ICT scheme under Outright purchase in 2006-07.
- 169 schools were approved for coverage under BOOT model in 2007-08. However, due to writ petition filed before the Hon'ble High Court of Madras, the scheme could not be implemented. The writ petition has been dismissed in August 2011.
- UT Administration proposes to cover remaining 182 schools (129 secondary and 53 higher secondary schools) under BOOT model.
- UT Administration also proposes to establish 4 smart schools, one in each district of Pudducherry, by converting existing schools.

- Revalidation of funds lying unutilized by the UT Administration and permission for using the same in the current financial year.
- Budgetary provision for coverage of remaining schools and establishment of 4 smart schools has already been provided in the UT budget.

9.2. After the presentation, following observations were made by the Members:

- Location of the schools proposed to be upgraded as smart schools along with details of whether infrastructure is available; teacher student ratio, etc. has not been provided.
- Time frame by which the scheme will be implemented. This was clarified that by February the scheme will be operationalised.
- Details of SC and ST students in the schools proposed to be covered is not available.

9.3. After discussions, following were the recommendations of PMEG:

- i) 182 schools (129 secondary and 53 higher secondary schools) were recommended for coverage under BOOT model for a period of 5 years w.e.f. 2011-12.
- ii) The central share of Rs.4.8 lakhs per school (Non-recurring) would be released as follows:
 - a. 2011-12 for 182 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school.
 - b. 2012-13 for 182 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - c. 2013-14 for 182 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - d. 2014-15 for 182 schools @ Rs 1.00 lakh per school
 - e. 2015-16 for 182 schools @ Rs0.80 lakh per school

- iii) 1st year installment for coverage of 182 schools would be released after adjustment of funds lying unutilized with UT Administration.
- iv) UT Administration would incur the funds lying unutilized with the UT Administration and on submission of utilization certificate, the remaining part of 1st year installment would be released.
- v) Recurring expenditure would be processed on file on reimbursement basis on submission of actual expenditure incurred and on installment of infrastructure.
- vi) PMEG recommended for establishment of 4 smart schools, one in each district under BOOT model for a period of 5 years.
- vii) Central share would be released for establishment of 4 smart schools subject to UT Administration submitting location; details of infrastructure available in these schools along with student-teacher ratio.

10. Proposal of SIET Hyderabad

10.1. Director, SIET, Hyderabad made a presentation, highlights of which are as under:

- Proposal is prepared based on the resolution taken in 21st Meeting of Executive Committee and Governing Body of APSIET, Hyderabad on 29.06.2011.
- Proposals include programme production, action plan, modernization of equipment and other items of expenditure for the financial year 2011-12.

10.2. During the presentation, it was found that financial assistance is being sought for production programmes (both indoor and outdoor) without details of the programmes being produced not being available. Due to this, PEMG had decided that the proposal of SIET Hyderabad be deferred. The proposal

would be discussed afresh in the next meeting, wherein Director SIET would submit the proposals along with the details of programmes being produced.

11. **Proposal of SIET Kerala**

11.1 Director, SIET Kerala made a presentation, highlights of which are as under:

- Proposal is for reimbursement of expenditure incurred amounting to Rs.8.27 lakh in connection with Seminar and Workshop conducted from 14.11.2010 to 16.11.2010 at Thunchanparambu, Tirur.
- 14,000 schools participated in the Children's Film Festival and the Seminar and Workshop was organized in the side lines of the Children's Film Festival.
- One time lunch was provided to the participating 3500 children for 3 days.
- Boarding and lodging of children participating in the Children's Film Festival was taken care of by the Principals of the Schools of these children.

11.2. After the presentation, following observations were made by the Members:

- The outcome of the seminar and workshop has not been highlighted.
- A report on the business conducted in the above mentioned Workshop/Seminar has still not been received.

11.3. After discussions, PMEG recommended for reimbursement of the expenditure incurred subject to SIET Kerala submitting a report on the business conducted in the above mentioned Workshop/Seminar.

The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.

.....